

FIFTEENTH INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE OF ICONOGRAPHIC STUDIES

Rijeka, 10 – 11 June 2021

(Zoom platform)

Iconography and Religious Otherness



Organizers

*Center for Iconographic Studies, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Rijeka
Department of Art History, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Split
Department of Education, Cultural Heritage and Tourism, University of Macerata*

in association with

*COST project: CA18129 - Islamic Legacy: Narratives East, West, South, North of the Mediterranean
(1250-1750)*

University of Ljubljana

Gregorian Pontifical University, Rome

Catholic University Leuven

Organizing committee

MARINA VICELJA-MATIJAŠIĆ, University of Rijeka
IVANA ČAPETA-RAKIĆ, University of Split
GIUSEPPE CAPRIOTTI, University of Macerata
BORJA FRANCO LLOPIS, UNED SPAIN / COST action CA18129
NIKOLINA BELOŠEVIĆ, University of Rijeka

Scientific committee

ANTONIO URQUÍZAR-HERRERA, UNED SPAIN / Chair of the cost action CA18129
DALIBOR PRANČEVIĆ, University of Split
YVONNE DOHNA SCHLOBITTEN, Gregorian Pontifical University Rome, Italy
MARTIN GERM, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia
BARBARA BAERT, Catholic University Leuven, Belgium

ONLINE CONFERENCE (ZOOM PRO PLATFORM)

link:

Thursday, 10 June:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87572817005?pwd=VnY4eG50cklrNXpaQU5BbEJ6OW1pUT09>

Friday, 11 June:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87572817005?pwd=VnY4eG50cklrNXpaQU5BbEJ6OW1pUT09>

For all information please contact Antonia Žurga (coordinator)
Filozofski fakultet Rijeka, Sveučilišna avenija 4, 51 000 Rijeka
Tel. +385 51 265776
E-mail: cis@ffri.hr
<http://cis.ffri.hr>



PROGRAM

Thursday, 10 June 2021

09:30

Opening of the Conference
Greetings and introductory speech
Presentation of IKON 14

10:00 – 10:45

Keynote lecture Debra Strickland

Otherness on the Hereford World Map (c. 1300)

10:45 – 12:15 / Panel 1 (moderator Marina Vicelja Matijašić)

Erik Eising

The Depicted Artwork as a Sign of Otherness: Differences and Similarities throughout Late-Medieval Europe

Karen von Veh

Mandeville's Travels, Medieval Monsters and the Construction of Difference

Iris Grötecke

Invention and Transformation of a new Sign: Paganism in Northern European Art of the Middle Ages

Eleanor Price

An Alliance of Sound and Bronze: Instrumentalizing Noise and the Other in Albert of Aachen's History of the Journey to Jerusalem

12:30 – 14:00 / Panel 2 (moderator Elena Paulino Montero)

Jakov Đorđević

Visualizing 'Sexual Otherness' in the Late Medieval Eastern Christian Monasteries

Sergei Zotov

Pagan Otherness in Christian Church: Iconography of Greek Gods and Philosophers in Russia and the Balkans

Dmitriy Antonov

Demonizing the Enemies: Russian Icons of "The Battle of Novgorodians with Suzdalians"

Ayeshi Biyanwila

Heracles as the Attendant of Buddha: Converted Iconography of Heracles in Gandharan Art

14:00 – 15:00 / LUNCH BREAK

15:00 – 15:45

Keynote lecture Claudia Cieri Via

Unveiling the Other: Art, Images, and Cultures

15:45 – 17:15 / Panel 3 (moderator Giuseppe Capriotti)

Katherine Bond

Costume & Confession: Fashioning Religious Otherness in Reformation-Era Europe

Elena Kiryanova

"Popish Plotters" and "Bloody Papists": Representation of the Catholics in the English Illustrated Pamphlets in the Civil Wars and the Commonwealth Period (1640-1660)

Nicolás Kwiatkowski

Martyrdom and the Visual Production of Otherness in Europe, 1450-1650

Valerija Macan Lukavečki

Religious Otherness in Giulio Clovio's Miniatures

17:15 – 18:30 / Panel 4 (moderator Karen von Veh)

Dmitriy Doronin

Christian and Shamanic Iconography in Altai: Depicting the Other

Rita Pamela Ladogana

Political Power and Religious Otherness in Fascist Era. The Polemic about the Connections between Judaism and Modernist Art and the Instrumental Use of the Nazi Iconography against Degenerate Art

Friday, 11 June 2021

09:30 – 10:15

Keynote lecture Giovanni Careri

The Ancestors': Flesh, Genealogy, and Eschatology in the Sistine Chapel

10:15 – 11:30 / Panel 5 (moderator Borja Franco Llopis)

Ivana Čapeta Rakić – Giuseppe Capriotti

An Inquiry into the Image of Jews in 15th-Century Istria: The Iconography of the Jewish-Christian Dispute

Sophia Abplanalp

Christian and Muslim Prisoners in European Art of the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century

Marta Battisti

"Whoever Belongs to God Hears What God Says" (John 8:47): Picturing the Other as Deaf in Italian Paintings of 14th to 16th centuries

11:30 – 12:15

Keynote lecture Luis Barnabé Pons

And the Hill Came to Mahomet. Visual (Mis)Representations of Islam and Its Prophet

12:15 – 13:45 / Panel 6 (moderator Antonio Urquizar Herrera)

Borja Franco Llopis

Complex Forms of Otherness: The Gigantomachy as an Example of the Battle between Islam and Christianity

Francesco Sorce

Crusades in the Square. The Triumph of Rome against the 'Infidels' by Maturino and Polidoro da Caravaggio

Maria Luisa Ricci

Exclude or Convert? The Image of the Muslim Slave in the Iconography of the Vision of St John of Matha in Rome

14:00 – 15:00 / LUNCH BREAK

15:00 – 16:30 / Panel 7 (moderator Ivana Čapeta Rakić)

Laura Stagno

Anachronism at Work: The 'Turk' as Image of the Enemy. Case Studies from Pontius Pilate to Protestant Persecutors of Catholic Martyrs

Mauro Salis

The Augustinian Way: Religious Otherness through the Images of Augustinian Devotion in the 16th and 17th centuries in Sardinia (considering Spain and other countries)

Olaya Sanfuentes

'Otherness' Underfoot. Enemies of Occidental Christian Culture Defeated by St James Apostle

Javier Cuevas

When Iberia Was Queer. The 'Sodomitic Moor' in 16th Century Spanish Painting

16:30 – 17:45 / Panel 8 (moderator Laura Stagno)

Özlem Yıldız

A Wise Enemy: The Seventeenth-Century Ottoman Portrayal of the Polish Commander Stanisław Żółkiewski

Marilena Pateraki

Monumental Management, Public Space Iconography and the Creation of the 'Muslim Other' in Inter-war Greece

Ömer Fatih Parlak

Variations in the Iconography of the 'Muslim Other' in the Late Medieval and Early Modern Board Games

18:00 – 18:30

Closing remarks

ABSTRACTS OF COMMUNICATIONS

Dr Debra Higgs Strickland

Professor of medieval Art History at School of Culture and Creative Arts
University of Glasgow, United Kingdom

Debra.Strickland@glasgow.ac.uk

Otherness on the Hereford World Map

This paper will examine Otherness on the Hereford World Map (c. 1300) in relation to established theoretical concepts of alterity and marginality to expose disjunctions between medieval and modern ideologies. Through exploration of its major design features and their contemporary theological meanings, I present the Map as a case example with which to reconsider the utility of these closely related theoretical concepts for our understanding of medieval art.

The Hereford Map's inhabited spaces, populated by hundreds of tiny icons and inscriptions, evoke the totality of creation and its debt to the Creator. However, I suggest that the locations of figural Others within the work's formal and spatial hierarchies do not map easily onto modern theoretical frameworks, signalling more complex relationships between Us and Them, centre and periphery. Through analysis of selected design features, I argue that pictorial strategies commonly interpreted by modern critics as 'marginal' in fact lay at the medieval conceptual centre as indicators of how ordinary Christians defined themselves and measured their worth. I further propose that 'cartographical Otherness' is performed on the Map not only by the usual figural suspects—the so-called Monstrous Races, women, and non-Christian outgroups—but also by conventional eschatological and Christological iconography. I conclude that Otherness on the Hereford Map was not tangential but rather essential to the medieval reader-viewer's meaningful negotiation of its multivalent spaces, including the location of their own positions in God's creation and in a Christian worldview.

Dr Erik Eising

Gemäldegalerie, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin

H.Eising@smb.spk-berlin.de

The Depicted Artwork as a Sign of Otherness: Differences and Similarities throughout Late-Medieval Europe

During late Middle Ages, painters in various European regions included images of figurative artworks or 'images-within-images' in their works. Examples range from depictions of sculptures to representations of paintings, mosaics, stained-glass figures, and even woodcuts. These depicted artworks could serve a variety of functions, both on a meta-level (i.e. as a comment on the nature of art itself, or as a form of illusionism), as well as in support of the content of the main scene (i.e. have a narrative or symbolic purpose). One particularly often-found function of the depicted artwork in late-medieval art is the indication of Otherness, for example through the representation of pagan idols or Old Testament imagery. Yet, a survey of the depiction of 'images-within-images' throughout late-medieval Europe reveals that the exact nature of the Otherness indicated by this type of imagery varies between European regions, centers, and even workshops. In fourteenth-century Italy, for example, the depicted artwork could be used to signify historical or temporal Otherness (i.e. placing a scene in the 'past'), while in fifteenth-century German art, images-within-images can frequently be identified as indications of religious or cultural Otherness (i.e. placing a biblical scene in a Jewish or pagan setting), often with negative connotations. Interestingly, although 'images-within-images' are common occurrence in fifteenth-century Netherlandish painting, they can rarely be interpreted in a critical manner towards the Other.

This conference paper, based on a doctoral dissertation completed in 2018 and defended in 2020, aims at illustrating the differences in the usage of this type of iconographic motif by Italian, German, and Netherlandish artists, as well as highlighting occasional similarities. In some cases, for example, specific motifs of this type were disseminated throughout Europe via travelling artists or transported artworks and subsequently picked up by artists elsewhere, whereby the original meaning or function of the motif in question was diluted, altered or ignored. Thus, the identity or meaning of the Other could change as well, in accordance with local or regional views and culture.

Dr Karen von Veh

Professor of Art History at Visual Art Department,
University of Johannesburg, South Africa

karenv@uj.ac.za

Mandeville's Travels, Medieval Monsters and the Construction of Difference

Monsters in Ancient Texts could be seen as a way of categorising strangeness and therefore dealing with the unknown. A physical embodiment of all the uncertainties and insecurities that faced man on unfamiliar territory - whether that territory was physical (geographical) or mental. By reducing those fears to a distortion of humanity or an aberration of nature, man was constructing monsters and marvels that related in some way to his own framework of knowledge – a negative trope by which the superiority of (Western) humanity could be measured. In most illustrated medieval *mappae mundi* the world is presented as a disc shaped image with Jerusalem at the exact centre, Europe close by, and the monsters situated at the outer edge, keeping them at a suitable distance due to their strangeness and the slight anxiety this engendered. This polarised version of the known and the unknown is also demonstrated in both scientific texts and popular travel writings, such as the work by the fictitious Sir John Mandeville known as *Mandeville's Travels*.

In my paper I explain how, from a European point of view, difference was constructed as visibly 'other' and situated as geographically 'elsewhere'. I argue that the connection of negative attributes to signs of difference, and the categorisation of monsters as less than human, was to have far-reaching effects on the attitudes of Western man to other races during the years of colonisation. In other words, it engendered a discourse of discrimination which was applied almost as a default category for 'the other' when Western explorers first encountered the people of Africa. This pattern of thought has been inculcated through literary and visual history until it appears to be an inherent part of the creation of a Western positive self-image, and no matter what form the 'other' takes, it has yet to undermine the West's overwhelming sense of superiority.

Dr Iris Grötecke

Independent scholar, Frechen, Germany

Groetecke.Forschung.Lehre@email.de

Emergence and Transformation of a Visual Sign: Paganism in Northern European Art of the Middle Ages

This study examines the religious Other from the perspective of Western and Northern European art of the Middle Ages. The study aims to reveal one visual sign for the vague medieval concept of 'paganism', out of a group of several iconographic motives, that have been overlooked so far, and to discuss its use and semantic range.

Scenes of the Passion of Christ and of the martyrdoms of early Christian saints in the 13th- and 14th-centuries art depict repeatedly persons wearing a bird's wing directly on their ears or across their heads. The motif has been understood as a fanciful decorative element or as an imperfect reproduction of the helmet of Mercury – the corresponding pictorial figures were interpreted either as persons hostile to Christianity or as merchants. However, the bird's wings were depicted more frequently in the period between 1200 and 1500 than has been assumed so far, and they were used by medieval artists not only to designate torturers and executioners of saints, but also persons from the Apocalypse, Old Testament narratives or simple peasants in secular pictorial contexts. That is why the motif needs new research.

The motif originates primarily in the Late Antique depictions of demons, wind personifications and images of fear such as the head of Medusa. However, the bird's wing is not a simple quotation from Antiquity like the statues of pagan gods in the legends of the saints, but it represents a creative appropriation of an originally Late Antique motif for medieval pictorial communication. The lecture will trace the stages of the motif's detachment from these models to its use as a freely available sign for followers of a (polytheistic) cult of idols.

This visualisation of a third – non-Christian and non-Jewish – position of faith within a strictly Christian environment is not intended to criticize the past. What is developed here is above all a rhetorical figure for visual judgement of persons, groups or ethical conduct, that could apply the current accusation of idolatry to both fantastic people at the borders of the world and to monotheistic Islam as well as to the little-known cultural practices in north-eastern Europe. So, this sign has a wider application in Christian artwork than supposed, but it conveys – depending on the context – different meanings.

Eleanor Price

PhD student

Eastman School of Music, University of Rochester, USA

eprice8@u.rochester.edu

An Alliance of Sound and Bronze: Instrumentalizing Noise and the Other in Albert of Aachen's *History of the Journey to Jerusalem*

Albert of Aachen records the battle with urgency, as if he were there. The reader is left with a sonic impression of the siege of Jerusalem that marks European victory in the First Crusade as a "horrible din" washes over Christian and Saracen soldiers alike, echoing across centuries and pages. In this paper, I examine a 12th century account of the First Crusade by Albert of Aachen to call attention to the ways in which sound is recorded in the narrative and used as an organizing and Othering force, suggesting that sound itself can be an icon. Albert's descriptions call to mind similarly "hideous" sounds of Othered groups (Goodman 2012, Eyerly 2020).

Sound itself has an iconic effect in the creation of fear and violence, as Steve Goodman shows in his *Sonic Warfare*, a text that also points to the material and sounding puissance of this First Crusade battle. While Suzanne Cusick suggests sound (and music) as weaponized forces are in ways an outgrowth of today's mediated soundscapes. The attention to materiality, especially the metallic cast of trumpets and iron-tipped whips, finds resonance in the works of Richard Cullen Rath (2003) and Alain Corbin (1998), both of whom explore the organizing and othering force of bells in Christian Europe (and America). Aachen himself draws attention to the centrality of the bells that Christians erected in the Holy Sepulchre. By establishing a bell tower for the observation of "psalms and the prayers of masses," the crusaders had established an outpost of Christian time in Jerusalem through sound. As the Christian forces were in many ways as disparate as their Muslim opponents, they needed the bells' tolls to solidify a collective front, a sonic icon allowing for unity. Bells also performed active defensive work for communities, ringing out against thunder. It seems significant, then, that Albert describes the Ethiopians' noise as "thunderous". The oncoming storm of heathens can be fought back through the power of instrumentalized sounding and reshaped bronze, with the crusaders relying on their newly established Christian space of Jerusalem.

Finally, sonic echoes exist in aspects of racial Othering, as Albert portrays many of the Saracens as Ethiopians. I read sonic evidence of medieval racializing in their descriptors, working with Geraldine Heng's useful definitions of race as it functions in this time period. In many ways, Ethiopia is a premodern Orient (in Edward Said's sense), serving as an Other for which the West (here the crusaders), can define itself. Regardless of who Albert's Ethiopians are and where they might be from, their bodies and sounds provide a backdrop upon which the European crusaders can paint Christian narratives of successful conquest and conversion. Such a formulation drives at the heart of the First Crusade's very purpose, strengthening the parallel of Christian soldiers ringing bell-like against the thunder of their religious rivals.

Jakov Đorđević

Ph.D., Research Associate
Department of History of Art
Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade, Serbia
jakovdj@gmail.com

Visualizing 'Sexual Otherness' in the Late Medieval Eastern Christian Monasteries

One of the principle concerns found in the monastic literature from the earliest Christian period deals with the question of how one can conquer bodily desires. Prohibitions in monastic *typika*, graphic stories in hagiographic works where holy monks encounter triggers of carnal passion, or sermons and manuals devised by spiritual fathers to their brethren, vividly attest to this anxiety because the sexual desire was always a lurking danger for those who had taken a vow of chastity. Interestingly enough, during the late medieval period in Eastern Christian monasteries, even images began to emerge that testify to the concern of preserving one's celibacy. The main aim of the present paper is to reconsider the original encounter between monks and those pictorial visualisations by relying on the theoretical construct of Other.

It will be argued that the images in question were envisioned in order to assert the notion of 'Sexual Otherness' based on the refusal of practicing sexual intercourse as the one of defining characteristics that separate those who have taken the monastic habit from the rest of the society. The conceptualized theoretical framework will not only enable the analysis of the employed visual strategies in creating the image of (diabolical) Other, but will also problematize the very notion of 'Sexual Otherness' in the monastic context. It will be shown that this type of Otherness was dynamic in the sense that the opposing, desired 'self' was meant to be achieved and performed rather than simply (naturally) embodied. Therefore, the process of affirming one's belonging to a particular, distinguished monastic group relied on the potential recognition of oneself in the image of the undesired Other. This paradoxical self-identification was imagined as a forewarning on the fragility of 'borders' that separate the contextually dominant group from the outer one, ever engaging monks further on their path to the utmost mortification of their bodies. The arguments will be presented through the analysis of three case studies: 1) the monumental figures of alluring nude sinners from Sopoćani Monastery; 2) the gruesome painted 'relief' of sinners from Gračanica Monastery; 3) the unusual representations of two demons (one with penile erection and the other in humiliating posture) depicted in the very sanctuary of the church of Mark's Monastery. All three examples contribute to the general understanding of the construction of the image of 'Sexual Other' in the late Eastern Christian monasticism, while simultaneously offering different iconographical solutions as well as distinct performative encounters.

Sergei Zotov

Junior researcher at Herzog August Bibliothek, Wolfenbüttel, Germany

Ph.D. student at Warwick University, United Kingdom

gargantyua@gmail.com

Pagan Otherness in Christian Church: Iconography of Greek Gods and Philosophers in Russia and the Balkans

This paper¹ examines the unique Orthodox iconography of 'saint' Greek philosophers (Anaxagoras, Pythagoras, Zeno, Socrates, Plato, Aristotle, Diogenes, and Solon), writers (Homer, Sophocles, Euripides, Thucydides, Aristophanes, Menander, Hippocrates, Plutarch, Virgil, and Galen), and even gods (such as Hermes, Apollo, Dionysus, Zeus, and Orpheus). They are often depicted in Russia such as on the walls of the Cathedral of the Annunciation of the Moscow Kremlin or on numerous icons, for example of Kargopol region.

This imagery originates from Greek works about ancient 'philosophers' translated into Russian in the 12th century. They were described as exemplary pagans who glorified Christ long before the birth of Christianity, allegedly predicting the coming of the Savior. Of course, none of the ancient writers has ever uttered a word of Christ, but in Russia little was known about their personalities and philosophy (sometimes nothing at all). Therefore, both ancient Greek and Roman poets and thinkers, doctors and even pagan gods were referred to as the "Hellenic sages", without making any distinction between them. Artists could replace Plato with Aristotle or Orpheus, which could be done only without any understanding of ancient Greek culture.

At the same time, there are dozens of frescoes with similar imagery in the Balkans – especially in Bulgaria, Romania and Greece. The images do not lack the historical accuracy. In Bulgarian Bachkovo monastery there is a 17th-century fresco, where Socrates is portrayed as a short-bearded mature man with a luxurious crown on his head and richly decorated clothes and shoes (attributes of sages from the Orient), while Plato, standing nearby, seems like a teenager due to the absence of any facial hair. Artists in this region surely knew that Socrates was a teacher of Plato, and that he was older. In the other Bulgarian fresco of the same period, in the Church of the Nativity of Christ in Arbanassi, Socrates, as well as Plato, Aristotle, Pythagoras, Homer, Solon, Plutarch, Sibyl, etc., have halos. The same iconography appeared in some Russian frescoes – but later on halos of "Hellenic sages" were removed.

In my paper I would try to consider the most important examples of this iconography in the Balkans and juxtapose it with Russian one, giving the explanation on distribution and reception of the unusual iconography. I would also discuss the practice of erasing particular details on these images.

1 The reported study was funded by RFBR, project No. 20-011-00385.

Dmitriy Antonov

Professor, Russian State University for the Humanities (Moscow)

Director, Center for Visual Studies of the Medieval and Early Modern Culture, RSUH (Moscow)

Senior Researcher in the School of Advanced Studies in the Humanities, RANEPa (Moscow)

antonov-dmitriy@list.ru

Demonizing the enemies: Russian icons of “The battle of Novgorodians with Suzdalians”

In early 1170, the Russian city of Novgorod was attacked by a coalition of Russian princes under the command of Mstislav of Suzdal, the son of Andrei Bogolyubsky. Novgorodians stood up to defend the city, wishing neither to obey prince Andrew, nor, moreover, to surrender the city to the invaders for plunder. The citizens managed to defend themselves and repel the enemies. According to the legend, the victory happened thanks to a miracle that was performed by the city icon of Our Lady “The Sign” (created in the 12th c.). The image became the palladium-icon. In 1357 it was moved from the Church of the Transfiguration to the Church of the Sign of the Mother of God specially built on the same street (today the icon is located in St. Sophia Cathedral in Novgorod). The legends about the miracle spread orally; two centuries later they were recorded in the Novgorod chronicles. Soon after, the legend became relevant again. In the 1460s–70s Novgorod was caught between two fires – its western neighbor, the Grand Duchy of Lithuania, and the Muscovite Russia. Realizing the imminence of invasion, Novgorodians pinned their hopes on the icon, which once protected them from the princes who arrived from ‘the bottom’ (as Russian territories to the south were referred to). At that time, Novgorodian artists created icons called “The Miracle of the icon of Our Lady ‘The Sign’ or the battle of Novgorodians with Suzdalians” to remind about the famous event. The new iconography clearly showed what had happened to the troops of Mstislav Andreevich and what awaited his followers.

A miracle did not happen – Muscovite grand prince Ivan III in the 1470s conquered Novgorod. Since that time, icons of “The battle of Novgorodians with Suzdalians” were venerated and created in a new social and political environment, still glorifying the palladium-icon. Today, seven icons of that kind are known, three of them have been lost and can be seen in photographs and sketches only.

Although many researchers have described the iconography of these images, many important features have gone unnoticed. Among all the icons, there is a completely unique and probably the oldest one, painted in the second half of the 15th century (presumably in the 1460s) and currently exhibited in the Novgorod Museum. Its anonymous creator had remarkable ingenuity and clearly hated Suzdalians (and possibly Muscovites). If we compare this icon with similar ones that date back to the end of the 15th – 16th cc. and the later ones of the 17th and 18th cc., we can find a number of nuances that make the visual story peculiar. In fact, the icon-painter created a well-thought-out invective against the enemies of Novgorod. Small signs and figures demonstrate that the foes were not just aggressors, but servants of the devil, God-fighters and religious opponents.

In the paper, I will analyze the specific features of all the seven icons – their geometric nuances, the figures and the position of characters. This will help to understand how different Russian iconographers built the ‘image of the enemy’ and why the icon from the Novgorod Museum collection can be seen as an unusual and severe visual accusation.

Ayeshi Biyanwila

PhD student
Postgraduate Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences,
University of Peradeniya, Sri Lanka
ayeshibiyawila@gmail.com

Heracles as the Attendant of Buddha: Converted Iconography of Heracles in Gandharan Art

Gandharan art flourished in North-Western India during 200 BC to 1 AD. The advent of the Greeks resulted from the conquests of Alexander the Great (356 BC-323 BC) in Asia made this region open to foreign influences which were later attributed to Scythians, Bactrians, Indo-Greeks, Indo-Bactrians, Indo-Scythians and Yu-eh-Zhi¹. The geography being open to these political unrests which continued for several centuries resulted in a unique form of culture composed of multicultural facets of art, language and religion. The area, highly influenced by Buddhism, is scattered with ruins of Buddhist monasteries and stupas often containing imagery and artistic motifs narrating stories of Buddha's last life and his previous births, known popularly as *Jataka Stories*.

These depictions are scattered with Hellenistic motifs of stylistic motifs and also of iconographic motifs such as Herakles and the Nemean Lion, Tyche, Dionysus and the Bacchanalia which reflect the presence of Greek influence owing to the political atmosphere described above. This paper will discuss how the iconography of Heracles has been used as the attendant of Buddha to show the supremacy of Buddhism over the otherness of Greek Religion in the region of Gandhara. According to Buddhism, Buddha is referred to as '*Satta-Deva-Manussanam*' - meaning the leader for all human beings and gods. Hence, it is natural for the artist of the Buddhist Gandhara to use the icon of Herakles, who he thought to be a divine creature as the attendant of Buddha; a place of subordination to give a clear idea of the religious otherness. The Gandharan artist who was well aware of the Greek artistic styles used the icon of Herakles together with his club and lionskin ubiquitously with and around Buddha.

The methodology of this research is to analyze several reliefs and sculpture portraying Herakles in Buddhist stories in Gandharan art. These pieces of art will be analyzed using secondary sources which are usually the previous research and texts on the style of Gandhara. This research would try to show that depictions of Herakles in Gandharan art has been used to juxtapose the supremacy of Buddha over the otherness rendered through the artistic iconography of Herakles; the Greek super hero/demigod which the artist identified to be non-other than a foreign deity.

1 Later known as the Kushans

Dr Katherine Bond

Postdoctoral Research Fellow, University College
Cork, Ireland

Katherine.bond@ucc.ie

Costume & Confession: Fashioning Religious Otherness in Reformation-Era Europe

Costume books and print series were big business in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Europe. Relying on the notion that clothing signalled and reinforced established cultural and social identities, costume figures wearing characteristic apparel quickly became popular visual icons for examining the diversity of human populations across the globe. Coinciding with a period of great religious upheaval and confessional strife, costume figures were also adopted to investigate Christian identities in the wake of the Reformation.

Dress had always played a significant role in the symbolic landscape that the Catholic hierarchy prescribed to. Divisions in clerical station and membership to various religious orders were expected to be clearly communicated through symbols of dress. Colours, textiles, silhouettes and insignia all played their part in this complex sign-system. The monk's "habit" was understood to uphold his *habitus* – his disposition and customary way of life. This was reinforced by the routine of wearing religious clothing as part of a constant practice of membership. But such practices were disrupted by questions about the function and meaning of clothing in a post-Reformation world. Of further challenge was the changing presence of clerical and monastic figures within society, as new identities forged from Lutheran success came to the fore, while Catholic orders suffered decline. The sartorial practices and fashions of laypeople, too, became a topic of great importance, in the struggle to solidify a confessional self that opposed the confessional 'other'. This paper demonstrates that through recycling and reuse, costume figures of clerics, monks, nuns, and laypeople were drawn into iconographies of religious identity that were integral to the popular construction of Christian "Others" in early modern Europe. Costume icons helped to deconstruct and reconstruct the relationship between religion and identity in this most turbulent period, formulating a symbolic visual language for what was familiar, strange, moral or immoral.

Dr Elena Kiryanova

Independent scholar, Ogulin, Croatia

elena.kirjanova@gmail.com

"Popish Plotters" and "Bloody Papists": Representation of the Catholics in the English Illustrated Pamphlets in the Civil Wars and the Commonwealth Period (1640-1660)

In the era of acute religious conflicts in the 16th- and 17th-century Europe the demonized representation of the Other was highly relevant, both in Protestant and Catholic nations. The Reformation and Counter-Reformation cultures created multiple images of 'the enemy', and the printing press made them highly available for the mass readers. As the British Isles were one of the 'fronts' of this pan-European conflict starting from the Tudor Reformation, the Civil Wars that broke out in 1640s created a fertile ground for this kind of image-making. Since this was a complex series of conflicts between the Crown and Parliament, among England, Scotland and Ireland and between the Protestants of different denominations and the Catholics - with the religious component of this crisis prominent - the images of the Other were quite different and multi-dimensional.

By the 1640s there already existed a well-established tradition of representing a religious opponent as a monster. In this paper I will examine the typology and iconography of this 'monsterification' of the Other, as well as its verbal background, on the British examples. The most obvious manifestation of monstrosity could be found within pamphlets about monsters which had become increasingly prominent in 1640s. Many of them demonstrated an amalgamation of religious and political criticism or contained political undertones (Crawford 2005; Soergel 2012; Cressy 2004).

For example, one of the major topic of political debates in early modern England was that of the king's "evil counselors". One of the most spectacular examples of this image of the enemy was an engraving with accompanying rhymes, entitled *The kingdom's monster uncloaked from heaven* (Monster 1643). The monster depicted on the engraving had three necks with many heads – one of the 'group of heads' stood for the Pope, Cardinals and Bishops, the second for 'malignant plotters', and the third for 'the bloody Irish'. This image embodied a well-known metaphor of the hydra, a 'many-headed monster'. My purpose here is to analyse the meaning of such metaphorical images and to compare these expressions of religious and political 'abnormalcy' with those of 'normalcy' (Grantley & Taunton 2000; Burke 2004).

Dr Nicolás Kwiatkowski

Universidad Nacional de San Martín – Consejo Nacional
de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas, Argentina

nkiako@unsam.edu.ar

Martyrdom and the Visual Production of Otherness in Europe, 1450-1650

In Christian thought and imagination, martyrdom is a fundamental expression of religious belief. The *corpus* representing individual and collective martyrdom was essential for theology and tirelessly represented in Christian iconography. From the *Trecento* onwards, the Massacre of the Holy Innocents became a prototypical image for the depiction of victims' innocence and suffering, but also for the attribution of barbarity and cruelty to the perpetrators. One of the consequences of the Early Modern religious wars and the conflictive relationships between Europeans and Turks was that biblical martyrdom, and in particular infant martyrdom, was used as a metaphor to represent contemporary killings and massacres.

My paper will discuss representations of real massacres as scenes of martyrdom in Early Modern Europe, in the two centuries: from the fall of Constantinople to the Thirty Years' War. First, I will briefly describe the iconography of martyrdom, focusing on that of the Massacre of the Holy Innocents, that emerged at the end of the Middle Ages and soon became topical. Next, I will study the use of this iconography to represent real massacres in realistic, propagandistic, and artistic imagery. Through pictures by Catholic and Protestant artists, I will show the construction of identities based on the display of innocence and victimhood, and the emergence of a religious other (Muslim, Catholic and Protestant in each case) imagined as cruel and barbaric.

The *corpus* will include Matteo di Giovanni's *Massacre of the Holy Innocents* (Siena, 1485-1495), the illustrations printed for Bartolomé de las Casas' *Brevísima relación...* (1541-1598), several engravings regarding the French Wars of Religion, Richard Verstegen's *Theatrum Crudelitatum Haereticorum* (1587), the images printed by anonymous artists for *De Spaensche Tiranye gheschiet in Nederlant* (1618-1624), engravings representing the violence of the Irish uprising in 1641-1642, and Hans Ulrich Francks' pictures of cruelty, printed between 1643 and 1656.

Dr Valerija Macan Lukavečki

Independent Scholar

Researcher on the project „Modern European Diplomacies and the Eastern Adriatic“, Croatian Institute of History, Zagreb, Croatia

valerija.macan@gmail.com; medea@isp.hr

Religious Otherness in Giulio Clovio's Miniatures

Giorgio Giulio Clovio (1498-1578) illuminated miniatures for high rank commissioners in the Roman Catholic Church. Although he used mostly Christian motives, they were often mixed with a pagan and different profane elements. Clovio's 'others' that will be analysed in this conference paper are *Antichi Romani* in the *Farnese hours* (New York, The Pierpont Morgan Library, MS 69). It is well known that the Renaissance art was inspired by the ancient Roman iconography and in this lecture the author will present two different iconographic *Antichi Romani* inspirations offering some new insights in the iconographic and iconological analysis. The first motive regards the roman carnival (*The Feast of Testaccio*, f. 40v-41r) and the reasons why it was introduced in the iconography of the *Farnese hours*, the catholic prayer book dedicated to a Virgin Mary. Analysing this representation alongside with *The Gulf of Naples* (f. 20 v-21r), the author will demonstrate the reasons for pagan elements introduced in the catholic prayer book illuminated for the Pope Paul III Farnese's grandson, the cardinal Alexander Farnese. Comparing literary sources on the cardinal Alexander's carnival *livrea* named "giovani grechi antichi" with mentioned miniatures and with Clovio's drawing *Gentelman standing* (Torino, Biblioteca reale, n. 15998) the author will argue that the reason for representing these iconographic elements is directly connected to the fact that cardinal had more than direct and active role in a carnival's celebrations in this period. As a second *Antichi Romani* representation, author will discuss iconographic and iconological meaning of a blue vase that appears on a border decoration of the representation of *The Adoration of the Shepherds – Adam and Eve in a Paradise Garden* (f. 26v-27r). The original pagan significance of this vase will be presented using 16th-century publications defined as Clovio's possessions few days after his death. The author will argue how its original pagan symbolism was related with the central representation iconography of the *folio*-s with the New and Old Testament motives.

Dr Dmitriy Doronin

Research fellow at School for Advanced Studies in Humanities

Research Laboratory for Theoretical Folklore Studies, RANEPa, Moscow, Russia

demetra2@mail.ru

Christian and Shamanic Iconography in Altai: Depicting the Other

This paper is devoted to the interaction of 'Our' and 'Other' sacred images in the Altai Icons veneration. Altaians are a Turkic people living in Southern Siberia (the Altai Republic). Many of the Altaians are shamanists even today. The Christianization of the Altai shamanists began in the 1830s, but was never completed. That is why there is a whole range of strategies for the complex relationship between Christian and shamanistic iconographic systems:

1 **Strategies for devaluation (visual denial) of Religious or Ethnic Otherness.**

Most Orthodox icons of 'Altaic saints' do not contain visual elements (codes) of Otherness. The mountains, the Katun River, or Lake Teletskoye are the only visual references to the Land of non-Christians (Altaians). Altaians with their special appearance, non-Christian culture, shamanic deities and spirits are completely denied by such Altaic icons.

2 **Strategies for derogation (visual distortion, semantic diminution) of Religious or Ethnic Otherness.**

There is an icon of St Archimandrite Makarii Glukharev, who baptizes an Altaian. The characteristic visual ethnic marker of this first shamanist who was baptized is his elongated black, slightly disheveled hair and replicas of this icon and religious painting from the 19th century in the Altai depict this marker. The Orthodox icon denies the cultural and religious identity of the Altaians associated with shamanic spirits/demons. Exorcised or reviled demons, as well as destroyed shamanic 'idols', are not depicted on icons. Not an icon, but a Christian legendary narrative tells about shamans and their 'demons'. Different 'modeling channels' (visual and verbal) tell us differently about the interaction of 'Our' and the Religious 'Other'. Where the icon is blank, the Christian legend abounds in detail.

3 **Takeover strategy: combining ethnographic details with markers of religious power and victory.** An old Altaian missionary talking to Altaians is a typical subject of such paintings. A strong visual marker of Otherness is depicted as ethnic clothing and Altai everyday life. However, these paintings lack any visual references to shamanism. The Christian chapel is the visual spatial focus of power in such paintings. This is a visual manifesto of the Russian Orthodox Church and a great claim to its power over the shamanic Altai.

4 **Inclusion strategies:** Shamanic rituals, national artefacts and revered natural sites are preserved, but reinterpreted through Christian imagery.

5 **Strategies for coexistence:** Christian and shamanic icons live together in the same house as living things (*eelü*). The action of these icons is functionally differentiated: for example, the mistress of the house feeds the icon of the shamanic spirit (*dyayyk*) if a thunder strikes, while Christian icons turn their faces to the wall so that other icons are not offended. In other cases, it is vice versa.

In this paper, each of these strategies will be analyzed in detail with the presentation of visual and textual material and artefacts of field materials from the last few years' research expeditions.

Dr Rita Pamela Ladogana

Associate Professor of History of Contemporary Art
at the Department of History, Cultural Heritage and Territory,
University of Cagliari, Italy

ladogana@unica.it

Political Power and Religious Otherness in Fascist Era. The Polemic about the Connections between Judaism and Modernist Art and the Instrumental Use of the Nazi Iconography against Degenerate Art

The term 'political religion', together with the related term 'secular religion', was used in the 20th century to define the experiences of the sacralisation of politics by movements and regimes that adopted a belief system in order to form a collective consciousness according to the aims of their ideology (Gentile 2001). In Italy, during the Second World War, the difficulties of relating to the Fascist regime became insurmountable and the artists' positions of opposition, which had started to show with the affirmation of the imperialist policy and the promulgation of racial laws, attained complete awareness. This paper investigates the expressions of anti-fascist dissidence, with a particular focus on the representation of the nude as an object of violence, chosen to testify in an iconographic sense to the abuses of despotic power during the tragic years of the war. A carnality expressed with anti-hedonistic objectivity that, in some cases, borders with the monstrous and grotesque. It seems to echo the monstrosity that the regime had adopted to represent the deformed inferiority of the impure races. The study therefore investigates the iconographic expression of ideological and political 'otherness' through the deformed representation of the dissidents bodies, which does not derive from being object but from the atrocity of subjugation.

The violence perpetrated following the Nazi invasion, after 8 September 1943, became the subject of denunciation and explicit revolt against the horrors of the regime. The dramatic war compositions *Gott mit Uns* by Renato Guttuso, exhibited at Roma's Gallery for the exhibition *L'arte contro la barbarie. Artisti romani contro l'oppressione nazifascista*, are the paradigm for Italian art's revolt against Nazi-Fascism. The striking examples for Guttuso are the distorted bodies of nude bathers painted in series by Fausto Pirandello from the late 1930s onwards. Pirandello depicts without rhetoric a painful human condition through iconography that has no connection with the classical tradition renewed by Cézanne and Renoir – the deformed nudes were destined to become a powerful symbol of anti-fascism. A fundamental testimony to this are the nudes in contorted positions (as if in a Dantean inferno) in the animate Mario Mafai's *Fantasie* (1939–1944). The reflection broadens the gaze towards the need to represent a physical and carnal reality with explicit intentions of anti-fascist political commitment, which began in the late 1930s. The paper will focus on the "Scuola Romana" and the demands for new realism expressed by the magazine *Corrente* in the Milanese context: from the apocalyptic scenarios of Ferruccio Ferrazzi to the paintings by Alberto Ziveri, up to the female nudes in Guttuso's *La Fuga dall'Etna* (1939).

Dr Nataša Kavčič

Assistant Professor at the Department of Art History
Faculty of Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

natasa.kavcic@ff.uni-lj.si

Otherness in Medieval Document Decoration

In the last few years, much has been done regarding the inclusion of decorated medieval documents in art historical studies; however, when it comes to the iconographic analyses, medieval charters have not yet received the scholarly attention they deserve. This seems to be the result of the apparent absence of greater artistic achievement compared to the richly illuminated manuscripts of devotional or literary nature. Another reason most probably lies in the sheer volume and the diversity of the preserved medieval charter material along with the fact that images suitable for such a discussion are scarce and often discovered by pure chance.

This paper aims to present a number of drawn figures, recognized as Jewish, complementing the text of medieval documents. While some of the chosen depictions have received brief attention by scholars in the past, they have been interpreted solely in the light of medieval Christian views of the Jewish society and thus recognized as strictly pejorative, even if the documents' contents were in no way religious. Conversely, the paper will emphasize the importance of a specific interpretative approach when dealing with the portrayal of Jews in the secular realm (i.e. legal and other documents) as opposed to the religious one (i.e. devotional manuscripts), meaning that it is not always possible to assume the same level of antisemitism in both spheres. It is true that some authors have discussed the possibility of neutral or even positive interpretation of medieval depictions of Jews, but such an approach has hitherto been mostly bound to the illustrations of the Old Testament (e.g. Jews as God's chosen people or as forerunners of Christians) or some literary works (e.g. Geoffrey Chaucer).

In short, the paper aims to draw attention to the images in medieval documents not researched enough by art historians, as well as to focus on the possibility that even the simplest depictions can be perceived as important records of the social standing of the Jewish minority in the environment in which a certain document was issued. It will be stressed that many of such portrayals may be seen as positive or at least neutral and that theological beliefs did not necessarily play a central role when it comes to decorating legal documents.

Dr Giovanni Battista Careri

Professor at Dipartimento del Culture del Progetto
University IUAV, Venice, Italy

gbcareri@iuav.it

The Ancestors': Flesh, Genealogy, and Eschatology in the Sistine Chapel

In the Sistine Chapel, the Ancestors' status of alterity is signalled through several forms of incongruity; the most evident appears in the relationship between the kings' and patriarchs' names (from the Gospel of Matthew) and the figures represented. In the Gospel, the ancestors' genealogy establishes Christ's 'historical' legitimacy by enrooting him in the human history and assigning him the role of the Messiah, King of Israel. Accordingly, the iconographic tradition depicts a line of majestic figures kings accompanied by their male progeny. However, in the Sistine chapel we're confronted with humble families engaged in domestic tasks or absorbed in melancholy.

The strange images of the *Ancestors* assume the role of figuring biological genealogy as a religious alterity. This work does not consist in the mere construction of the Other but rather in the construction of a structural *position* in Christian history: a position I call *carnal* as far as it adheres to the carnal condition that slows and delays the progress of Christian Salvation.

Dr Ivana Čapeta Rakić

Associated Professor at the Department of art History
Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences,
University of Split, Croatia
icapeta@ffst.hr

Dr Giuseppe Capriotti

Associated Professor at Dipartimento
di Scienze della formazione, dei beni
culturali e del turismo,
University of Macerata, Italy
giuseppe.capriotti@unimc.it

An Inquiry into the Image of Jews in 15th-Century Istria: The Iconography of the Jewish-Christian Dispute

The external features with which Jews are marked in Christian iconography have long been known and specified. The differentiations emerged largely after the Crusades, and especially after the Fourth Lateran Council, when it was decided that Jews and Saracens must be distinguished from Christians by the way they dress. Prior to that, external distinctive features of Jews rarely appeared in the fine arts and were predominantly reserved for Jewish high priests. Therefore, it is an interesting fact that one of the earliest depictions in which Jewish attributes can be seen is located in Istria. In the mosaic in the apse of the Euphrasius Basilica, the prophet Zechariah was depicted with tefillin as early as in the 6th century. In the late Middle Ages, numerous paintings were created in the area of the Istrian peninsula in which the external features of religious otherness, predominantly those of Jews, can be recognized. This is primarily manifested by the Jewish hat, as the most common attribute of Jews in Christian iconography, but also by some other symbols such as scorpions or physical deformations, which are attributed to Jews. In this preliminary research, we recognized such attributes on the frescoes in Pazin, Lindar, Lovran, Beram, Gračišće, Svetvinčenat, Pićan and Vižinada. A comprehensive research on this topic in the aforementioned territory, however, is yet to be conducted. For the purpose of this conference the focus of our research is directed towards the localities of Lindar, Beram and Vižinada, with a special emphasis on the topics of Disputes of Christians and Jews in the iconography of painted narratives. In the church of Saint Catherine in Lindar a very complex iconography of the Living Cross can be found between the personifications of the Church and the Synagogue. These topics emerged from a treatise attributed to St Augustine, in which the Christian truths contrast with Jewish traditions. In Beram and Vižinada the theme of the Jewish-Christian dispute is visualized through the iconography of Christ among the Doctors, in which the painters intensify the expressions of disagreement and confusion of the Jews, represented by means of specific clothes and gestures. At the same time, we will endeavor to explore and explain the emergence and the presence of these topics within the geopolitical context.

Sophia Abplanalp

Independent scholar, Vienna, Austria

sophia_abplanalp@hotmail.com

Christian and Muslim Prisoners in European art of the sixteenth and seventeenth century

During the sixteenth and seventeenth century many, differently motivated encounters between Christians and Muslims took place. Amongst one of the most famous is the First and Second Siege of Vienna in the years 1529 and 1683. Also, economically and politically driven encounters took place, such as the raiding of European ships by Muslim corsairs in the Mediterranean Sea. Both kinds of confrontation could end for Muslims, as well as for Christians, in hostage or slavery. In European art we can find many depictions of Christian and Muslim slaves. However, the depiction of them in terms of their iconography and iconology varies widely and was not yet discussed thoroughly in literature from an art historical point of view.

On the one side, 'Muslim prisoners' are nearly exclusively depicted in images of historical battles, such as the Second Siege of Vienna. Especially the engravings by Romeyn de Hooghe, who created a series about the siege in 1684, include a highly interesting depiction of Muslim prisoners. The Christian vanquishers are shown in full glory, with richly ornamented gowns and armour, their mimic is more refined, and they appear as standing figures. At the same time, the Ottomans are placed lower than the Christians within the composition, kneeling and bowing down in front of their victorious enemies, while their faces show strong, grimace-like expressions.

On the other side, 'Christian prisoners', which are known to have been captured by Algerian corsairs and Turks, are depicted in a different manner. In the illustrated book *Histoire de Barbarie et de ses Corsaires* by Pierre Dan, we can find many depictions of Muslims torturing Christians in different ways. The images are illustrating the written text, which is about the travel of the author to North Africa to free Christian slaves, taken as hostages, with ransom. The frontispiece of the book is exceptional, as the Christian is assigned with two different roles in one image: the 'victim' and the 'liberator'.

The goal of this paper is to analyse the iconography of the Muslim slave and the Christian slave, which can be found in the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century European art, and consequently put it into the context of Christian iconographic and iconological traditions. Especially the depictions of the Christian slaves show similarities in their iconography with depictions of Christian saints – for example the martyrdom of Saint Sebastian. The Christian slaves are depicted as martyrs in terms of the content, as they are killed and tortured for their beliefs, and at the same time their iconography is referring to images of saints, which also endured torture. In compliance to the Christian, being depicted as an enduring believer, the Muslim is depicted as cruel torturer. Contrary, when the Muslim takes on the role of a slave, the Christian is shown as the righteously superior one. These examples show clearly that the identities of the Christian and the Muslim depend on each other but are in their nature contrary. The Christians are always depicting themselves as the superior one or the victim, but always with the intention of marginalizing the other. The role of the 'Religious Other' is imposed on Muslims, which subsequently, defines how the Christians characterize themselves. The 'Self' of the Christian and the 'Otherness' of the Muslim are interconnected, whereas the complex construction of these identities is expressed through the different iconographies used. In my paper I will expand further on the ideas and concepts of the interplay of the 'Self' and the 'Other' and their expressions in iconography, as well as their reference to the political situation between Christians and Muslims.

Marta Battisti

PhD candidate at the Université Grenoble Alpes, France

Marta.Battisti@univ-grenoble-alpes.fr

“Whoever Belongs to God Hears What God Says” (John 8:47): Picturing the Other as Deaf in Italian Paintings of 14th to 16th centuries

This paper explores the Christian visual construction of the Other as deaf in Italian Early Modern religious paintings (13th-16th centuries) and aims to demonstrate the existence of a visual pedagogy of aural sensations in Christian iconography. The act of listening to God’s Word is the main distinguishing feature of the Christian faithful, as written in John 8:47: “Whoever belongs to God hears what God says. The reason you do not hear is that you do not belong to God”. Therefore, refusing to lend an ear to the Word becomes the principal characteristic of the Others, whether they are Jews, heretics or impious. Through the centuries, theologians developed the distinction between Christian listeners and the deaf Others, who cannot hear the Word with their spiritual ear. This contrast appears clearly within Christian figurative practices, where characters “giving ear” (Deuteronomy 31:1) are opposed to the ones “shutting their ear” (Psalm 58:4).

The paper analyses several iconographies displaying the gesture of shutting the ears, such as *Bestiaries’* illustrations of the asp, the Christian symbol of intentional deafness after Psalm 58:4: “They are like the deaf asp that stoppeth her ear”. It also takes into consideration militant iconographies, where this gesture occurs against the evangelical attempt to convert the Jew or the heretic Other: for instance, representations of *Saint Stephen’s Disputation with the Elders of the Sanhedrin* or the fresco representing *The Church Militant and Triumphant* (1366-67) in the Dominican convent of Santa Maria Novella in Florence. Furthermore, depictions of spiritual deafness will be taken into consideration through the analysis of images of *Jesus Christ among the Doctors of the Synagogue* or the *Triumph of Saint Thomas Aquinas over the Heretics*. Within these representations will be presented different visual strategies involving the destruction of books, symbols of the Old Testament or heretic thought, to show the conversion of the Other and the beginning of his listening to the true Word.

To attain a global understanding of the pedagogical purpose of such iconographic practices, specific attention is paid to the figurative mechanisms suggesting an interaction between the painted audience and the real one. Thus, the paper also refers to the emotional effects that these images, generally depicted in liturgical spaces, could have on the beholders.

Dr Luis Barnabé Pons

Professor of Arabic and Islamic Studies
Department of Languages, University of Alicante, Spain
luis.bernabe@ua.es

And the Hill Came to Mahomet Visual (Mis)Representations of Islam and Its Prophet

The representation of Islam by Europe especially from the Middle Ages to the Modern Age, but also in our days, could in a certain way be classified within what the anthropologist Donald E. Brown (followed by Steven Pinker) calls "human universals". Belief in the supernatural, along with fear, judgment of others, or self-image form some of the universal frameworks that have made the representation of Islam familiar throughout the world. The repetition of certain elements associated with Islam, its prophet and its society have created a very widespread image that in many respects has replaced reality. This phenomenon can be seen in a particular mood in the representations of the Prophet Muhammad. Not all these representations are the same and not all participate fully in these traits, but the vast majority are loaded with negative meanings. This fear / hate regarding Islam has meant that the more "neutral" or "positive" representations of Muhammad have gone quite unnoticed by the mainstream of distrust before a prophet who disputes the most classical religious beliefs in European history. Many of these representations will be discussed in my note, trying to show the complexities of going from the representation of the unknown to the representation of the distrustful.

Dr Borja Franco Llopis

Assistant Professor at the Department of Art History
Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (UNED), Spain

bfranco@geo.uned.es

Complex Forms of Otherness: The Gigantomachy as an Example of the Battle between Islam and Christianity

One of the bloodiest wars on the Iberian Peninsula took place between 1568 and 1571 – the Rebellion of the Alpujarras. The battle included Moriscos, Turks and Berber pirates pitted against the troops of King Philip II, commanded by Don John of Austria, as they rose up to defy the prohibitions decreed by the monarch. The war coincided with another battle that was extremely important in defining the image of the Muslim as enemy in the Mediterranean: the Battle of Lepanto (1571). After these battles, the image of converts from Islam started to be assimilated to that of the Turks, in the collective imagination. One of the most-employed iconographies to depict religious and political clashes was that of the Gigantomachy. We can view it at the Palazzo del Te in Mantua and in the ephemeral decorations at numerous European royal entrances. This paper analyses the development of such iconography in the visual culture of the Iberian Peninsula, placing special focus on the cover of the *The Civil Wars of Granada (Guerras Civiles de Granada)* by Ginés Pérez de Hita, created by Flemish painter Petrus Firens in 1606. This illustration is extraordinarily interesting. On the one hand, the author uses the Gigantomachy to illustrate – in a single image – the wars of the Alpujarras and Lepanto. On the other, the composition is structurally organised as if it was a triumphal arch, thus showing the interrelation between artistic genres. And, lastly, the author enriches the illustration with numerous quotes by Virgil, relating the action to the wars in classical Antiquity. The Moriscos and Turks are indistinguishable, represented wearing the same clothing, while the monarch is depicted as Jupiter. It is one of the most complex works of anti-Islamic iconography on the Peninsula whose in-depth analysis is still a pending subject.

Dr Francesco Sorce

Independent scholar, Rome, Italy

sorce18@gmail.com

Crusades in the Square. The Triumph of Rome against the 'Infidels' by Maturino and Polidoro da Caravaggio

The purpose of this paper is to examine the decoration realized between 1519 and 1520 by Maturino da Firenze and Polidoro da Caravaggio on a façade of a palace in piazza Capranica, Rome. This mural painting, now lost, is known through a small group of drawings and, mostly, an engraving by Giovan Battista de' Cavalieri from 1581, which represents the central and most meaningful part of the work by Raphael's two assistants. The painted frieze recorded by the late sixteenth-century print is a significant example of the crusade propaganda in Rome during the pontificate of Leo X. As a matter of fact, the fresco features several typical themes of the rhetoric repertoire employed in the Leonine City to create a favorable environment in support of the war against the Ottomans.

The subject depicted by Maturino and Polidoro – an allegory of the triumph of Rome and the universal conversion of the 'infidels' – presents compelling analogies with the schemes and motives of eschatological and prophetic literature, which, at the time, were often interpreted in an anti-Turkish way and can be found in the propagandistic writings of some key figures in Rome's intellectual scene, such as Pietro Quirini and Paolo Giustiniani (*Libellus ad Leonem Decimum*, 1513), Egidio da Viterbo (*Historia Viginti Saeculorum*, c. 1513-1518), Pietro Galatino (*Oratio de Circumcisione Dominica*, 1515), Stefano Taleazzi (Oration delivered before the Fifth Lateran Council on 4 May 1515), and Paolo Giovio (*Ad Leonem Decimum...suasoria in Turcas*, 1518).

At the beginning of Cinquecento, the widespread teleological narrative used by some of Raphaelite painters – quite common in contemporary texts, too – is considered very efficient in situating the Turks within the whole context of Christian history. The above-mentioned narrative offers a (pre-)vision of the definitive victory over Islam, and is therefore considered helpful in giving hope to the people threatened by the Ottoman Empire. Not surprisingly, the quotation from John 10, 16 "fiet unum ovile et unus pastor" appears in the print by De' Cavalieri (and most probably in the fresco by Maturino and Polidoro). Indeed, the passage is frequently included in early modern prophetic literature about the hopes of triumph over Islam.

The communicative power of this work – due to its visibility in a central square – is comparable to the impact on collective imagination of the predictions by itinerant hermits and popular prophets, such as the well-known monk Fra Bonaventura, who preached in Rome in 1511 and 1516, announcing the coming of a new golden age after the Turks' (near) defeat and baptism. Therefore, the aim of this paper is to highlight the figurative and textual sources of the fresco, to explain its semiotic functioning and consider it within the artistic environment of Medicean Rome, comparing the decoration of piazza Capranica to other coeval propagandistic frescoes such as, for example, those by Pellegrino da Modena in the Serra Chapel in the church of San Giacomo degli Spagnoli.

Maria Luisa Ricci

PhD student

Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (UNED), Spain

marialuisaricci4@gmail.com

Exclude or Convert? The Image of the Muslim Slave in the Iconography of the Vision of St John of Matha in Rome

On January 28, 1193, during his first mass, St John of Matha had a vision: Christ holding two chained men by the hand, one deformed black and one malnourished white. Following this event, the saint, together with St Felix of Valois, founded the religious order of the Trinitarians, approved in 1198 by Pope Innocent III, intending to free Christian slaves from the hands of the Saracens, and to prevent them from denying their faith to embrace that of the infidels. The figurative translation of the vision of the founder becomes, as early as the 13th century, the iconographic *topos* of the order. The first representation of the vision is the mosaic placed on the façade of the Roman church of San Tommaso in Formis. The work shows Christ in the centre seated on a throne, flanked by two smaller characters: one black and one white. Both characters are chained but the white figure has broken chains with the ends that join the throne of Christ and holds the banner surmounted by a cross in Trinitarian colours. The black character, to the left of the Savior, who can be identified as a Moor or Saracen captive, is still in chains (symbol of infidelity) and is grabbed on the wrist by Christ (a coercive gesture that symbolizes wanting to exercise power towards someone). The slave is also represented as an Ethiopian to accentuate the dark colour of his skin and, therefore, to emphasize his negative image, of evil and sinful character. These elements could be interpreted as a willingness on the part of the order to direct the redemptive activity to the Christian alone, who because of his faith is reduced to captivity and therefore represented as just released. The Moor is excluded from the redemptive action due to his infidelity.

Starting from the 15th century, an important innovation was introduced in the representation of the vision of St John of Matha: the substitution of an angel for the figure of Christ in the act of crossing the chains (or his arms) of the two captives, one Christian and the other Muslim, alluding to their exchange for their freedom (provided by the third rule of the statute of the order). The paper intends to analyze the representation of the Muslim slave in the vision of St John of Matha, in particular through the many examples in the church of St Trinità degli Spagnoli in Rome, which presents the iconographic variant with the representation of the angel replacing Christ. Here the Muslim is depicted with different gestures and physiognomies: as a Turk or Barbaresco with his hands joined in prayer, with the shaved skull with ponytails and the long moustache typical of the rowing slaves of the galleys and about to escape, as a sub-Saharan African, while grabbing his chains or while bringing his hand to his chest. Which is the meaning of these elements of singularity?

Departing from this consideration, the aim of the paper is to examine and understand the transition from an iconography in which the Muslim is a totally negative figure and excluded from the activity of redemption of the order to the iconography of the angel who crosses the chains alluding to exchange and therefore to the liberation of the Muslim.

Dr Mauro Salis

Assistant Professor at Dipartimento di Lettere, Lingue e Beni Culturali,
University of Cagliari, Italy

Associate researcher at the Institut Català de Recerca en
Patrimoni Cultural in Girona, Spain

maurosalis@protonmail.com

The Augustinian Way: Religious Otherness through the Images of Augustinian Devotion in the 16th and 17th centuries in Sardinia (Including Spain and Other Countries)

Several studies have highlighted the role assigned to images by religious congregations, particularly since the era of the Counter-Reformation. Among the less studied religious orders are the Augustinians, who from the very beginning of the 16th century initiated within themselves a profound criticism of the evils of the Church. The most famous outcome of this criticism was Martin Luther's 'protest' in Germany. In other Western European territories, struck by similar social problems but with a different cultural substrate and political context, the Augustinian Order faced the problems of the time starting with a careful reform of its organization with the aim of being able to operate at its best in each territorial context according to the peculiar social, political and cultural contingencies. This reform also included, in 1512, the establishment of the Augustinian Province of Sardinia, including Valencia, the Balearic Islands and the island of Sardinia, until then dependent on the Neapolitan Province based in the convent of San Giovanni a Carbonara in Naples. The organizational reform was requested by the catalan Joan Exarch, who had the task of organizing the new district. This Province received the name "of Sardinia" in memory of the Sardinian exile of the remains of Saint Augustine (later transferred to Pavia in the 8th century), but the main convent was that of Nuestra Señora del Socorro in Valencia. In this way the extension of the religious institution coincided with the political one, as the Kingdom of Sardinia, the Kingdom of Mallorca (Balearic Islands) and the Kingdom of Valencia were part of the Crown of Aragon and, given their geographical position in the Mediterranean Sea, they were the Crown's last line of defense against the Turkish offensive. These territories were in fact under constant attack by Ottoman raids and many inhabitants were captured and enslaved. Furthermore, in these territories the percentage of *Moriscos* (the descendants of the forcibly baptized Iberian Muslims) was high, which is why the issue of the conflict between religions was strongly felt, to the point of being constantly at the center of the political actions of the Crown sovereigns. This conflict between the two religions can also be found in the images of Augustinian devotion, which in these areas showed a unitary action (based on the directives of the main Priory of Valencia) condemning the Muslim "heresy" (but also the Protestant one).

With the appointment (1533) of Saint Tomás de Villanueva to the office of Provincial Prior, the attention of the Augustinians towards the *Morisco* issue increased and also their interest in the role played by images: in the Iberian Peninsula the Augustinian order had to submit to the tight political rules from the King to control the infidels, leaving no room for any glimmer of tolerance. While in Sardinia, where the meshes of political and ecclesiastical control (Inquisition) were less tight, the Augustinians, also referring to the sermons of Saint Tomás de Villanueva, elaborated new iconographic types and new images regarding the relationship (less intransigent) with the other religion.

In this paper I will present an iconographic analysis of Augustinian images between Valencia, Balearic Islands and Sardinia, their common aspects and the differences with respect to the attitude towards the other religion, especially in reference to the issues concerning heresy, conversion, apostasy and reconversion.

Dr Olaya Sanfuentes

Professor at the History Department
Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile
osanfuen@uc.cl; osanfuentes@gmail.com

'Otherness' Underfoot. Enemies of Occidental Christian Culture Defeated by St James Apostle

The figure of St James riding his white horse and conquering the enemy is found throughout the Hispano-American world. While the image originated in Compostela (Galicia) in the 13th century to show the victory of Christ's apostle over the Muslims, in the 16th century it migrated to America to defeat the Christian faith's new enemy: the indigenous Americans.

This equestrian figure of a hero crushing the enemy underfoot is what Aby Warburg referred to as a *pathosformel* - an effective, efficient figure that visually embodies the emotional charge of a time period and is part of a cultural strategy. The horseback rider is a triumphant hero who embodies the possibility of salvation for a culture that feels threatened with extinction. A fierce, white horse tramples the enemy underfoot. This enemy represents 'otherness', which is a threat to the system's stability.

A foundational milestone of this iconography depicts Alejandro Magno destroying whole populations in order to found his legendary empire. Subsequently, iconography adapted to the Western Christian culture and the character of St James the Moor-slayer emerged. His first iconographic appearance was on the gable of the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. The knight was charged with destroying people of other religious denominations in order to advance the consolidation of Christian territory on the Iberian Peninsula. The 'other' is the Muslim or the Moor, who had invaded Iberian lands and inhabited them for several centuries.

The 1492 Catholic Kings' takeover of Granada, the last Moorish holdout on the Iberian Peninsula, coincides with the so-called discovery of America. The conquest of these new lands brought with it a new enemy, which embodied religious and cultural 'otherness', a new enemy whose beliefs and 'idolatry' needed to be destroyed, a new enemy to be crushed by St James' fierce horse: the indigenous Americans. With regards to the conquest of the American territory's visual strategy, images that portrayed the Moor as an enemy continued to be produced, turning this iconography into a demonstration of the overall victory of the Christian religion over other belief systems. The simultaneously emerging iconography depicted a defeated indigenous American and a victorious St James the Moor-slayer.

In summary, the term *formula* is applied to the more universal aspect of certain iconography and the term *pathos* is applied to ways of representing the emotional charge therein. I propose to approach the case study on St James defeating the enemy in the following way: the *formula* is one of the hero on horseback defeating the enemy; the *pathos* is one of the enemy pleading for mercy or defending himself unsuccessfully. This enemy evolves over space and time, and represents 'otherness'.

Dr Javier Cuevas

Lecturer at Department of History of Art,
University of Malaga, Spain

jcuevasb@uma.es

When Iberia Was Queer The 'Sodomitic Moor' in 16th Century Spanish Painting

Unlike other European countries where national construction began in the 19th century, in Spain this process goes back to 1492, when the Catholic Monarchs took Granada and Jews were forced to conversion or expulsion (America was 'discovered', and the first Castilian grammar was published by Antonio de Nebrija). Moreover, it is at this time that sodomy begins to be conceptualized as a sin exclusive to the other race, and when the trope of the 'Sodomitic Moor' was constructed to mark the vileness of the infidels, on the one hand, and the purity of the Spanish, on the other. The idea of sodomy, perceived as a crime and a sin against nature, was not given but actively fabricated by the chroniclers, theologians and moralists of the sixteenth century in Spain and 'Nueva España' (Mexico).

Although the trope 'Sodomitic Moor' is consolidated in the context of the imperialist/colonialist expansion towards America and linked to the process of expulsion of the Moors of Spain that will culminate at the beginning of the 17th century, its origins are medieval and, therefore, pre-colonial. A good example that gives an account of the way in which this trope was built are the literary sources and visual depictions of the martyrdom of Saint Pelayo. According to medieval Christian sources (10th century), the young Pelayo was martyred for not succumbing to the sexual interest of Caliph Abd al-Rhaman III. These Christian sources contrast the virtue of Pelayo's chastity with the vice of lust of the Caliph Abd al-Rhaman III. These literary sources were the basis from which the painter known as Master from Becerril painted the martyrdom of Saint Pelayo that is now preserved in Malaga's Cathedral.

Through pictorial resources such as the contrast between the luxury of Abd al-Rhaman III's clothes and Pelayo's nude, we can see how in the medieval Iberian context and in the modern one (16th century) the 'Other' Muslim is constructed as a representative of all vices, including the nefarious vice of Sodomy.

This paper will focus on the visual (Maestro de Becerril, 16th century) and literary representations of the martyrdom of Saint Pelayo and the way in which the depiction of the racialized 'other', represented in the figure of Abd Al-Rahman III, is integrated.

Özlem Yıldız

PhD student in Art History

Tyler School of Art and Architecture, Temple University, USA

tun53598@temple.edu

A Wise Enemy: The Seventeenth-Century Ottoman Portrayal of the Polish Commander Stanisław Żółkiewski

Ottoman *şehnâme*s, or illustrated history books, are full of heroes and rivals, but the Polish commander Stanisław Żółkiewski has a special place in *Şehname-i Nadiri* of the early seventeenth century. The legend of Hetman Żółkiewski was secured in the Polish history with his contemporaneous and later depictions in painting and literature, yet the depiction of this significant character in a very well-known Ottoman illustrated history remained hitherto unidentified. This paper will analyze the Ottoman discourse on the political and military others of the state through Nadiri's textual description and Nakşi's visual portrayal of Commander Żółkiewski. *Şehname-i Nadiri*, composed in 1622, is an illustrated book that recounts the events during the reign of the Ottoman sultan Osman II (1618 – 1622). The book records wars fought, and rebellions repressed by the Ottomans in the four years. It is a vivid narrative of the preparation and progress of each campaign, and the main characters are rendered into dramatic protagonists and antagonists. Among the antagonists of this Ottoman narrative, the Polish commander Stanisław Żółkiewski is the most exceptional. The Battle of Cecora (1620), in which he led the Polish army against the Ottomans, constitutes one chapter in the book, and this chapter is marked with a long description of the Polish commander, as well as a battle scene painting.

The 'otherness' of Żółkiewski, religious or otherwise, as the leader of the Christian army that faced the Ottomans, or "the soldiers of Islam" as Nadiri calls them, is conveyed in a series of characteristics attributed to him. He is portrayed as a great soldier and a powerful ruler, whereas he is also described as evil and ultimately defeated. On the one hand, he is compared to the great heroes of the *Shahname-i Ferdowsi*, the eleventh-century Persian epic that was copied and illustrated widely in the early modern Islamic courts, just as the Ottoman sultan and commanders are likened to similar heroic characters. On the other hand, his death on the battlefield is narrated in a way that belittles him and exalts the Ottoman victory. In contrast to the Polish narratives that portray Żółkiewski fighting bravely until his last moment, according to Nadiri, Żółkiewski was killed while he was retreating. The painter of *Şehname-i Nadiri* depicts that exact moment in perfect harmony with the text.

As the only rival who was painted in *Şehname-i Nadiri*, Żółkiewski was granted a special position, even greater than that of the long-time archenemy of the Ottomans, the Safavid Shah Abbas I. An analysis of the description of Ottoman rivals in *Şehname-i Nadiri*, Żółkiewski, helps us explore an Ottoman attitude to otherness. This attitude creates the 'other' through the characteristics that are most familiar to the author's and audience's own culture. It draws parallels between the 'other' and the well-known figures such as historical or fictional heroes and villains in the form of satire and praise. However, the 'other' seems destined for escape and defeat in this textual and visual narrative, merely because of who he is, however strong or wise he may be.

Marilena Pateraki

PhD Student

Paris 1 Panthéon – Sorbonne, France

Department of History and Archaeology, University of Crete, Greece

pateraki.marilena@gmail.com

Monumental Management, Public Space Iconography and the Creation of the 'Muslim Other' in Interwar Greece

This paper focuses on the treatment of historic Islamic buildings in Greece so as to investigate how the notion of Muslim otherness is developed and reproduced through strategies dealing with the iconography of landscape in material and symbolic terms. It showcases unstudied, early heritagization trends for Ottoman-era religious buildings, analyzing relevant public discourse as well as formal strategies for their integration in the national monumental canon. Addressing misconceptions about the monolithic nature of state nationalism but also of social reactions towards the Ottoman past, it analyzes management practices for public space iconography with regard to the historic Muslim architectural trace; a management that includes both the material treatment of buildings and the discursive negotiation of their contents and meanings.

After the Population Exchange between Greece and Turkey (1924), religious Islamic buildings in most parts of the Greek state turned into definitive markers of the past. A preservation framework for those buildings emerged, which often collided with the fact that these were also seen as financial assets in the context of implementing the Exchange. The result was a fragmented monumentalization process, through competition among the Archaeological Service, the National Bank of Greece - charged with land property manager's duties - and other parties such as the church, local administration or civil society bodies.

How is the notion of 'Muslim monument' born, in this context, within the official heritage apparatus and the sphere of print press? Over the following decades, public visual traces of past Muslim dominance are largely demolished, or left to abandonment and destruction; interwar archives offer a glimpse into a moment when such vestiges function as nodes both of living social memory and of an officially projected collective identity. The buildings negotiated for monument registration are, at the time, almost exclusively mosques. This religious reference is crucial in raising them into potential partakers of the national canon, even if they appear at odds with it, with integration strategies oscillating among an orientalising exoticization, a self-referential lens that validates the nation via its ordeals, or endurance, and strategies focusing on overriding materiality, linking 'foreign' forms to familiar meanings.

What discursive lines are adopted by the state that create and reproduce the perception of Muslims as a historical alterity in the newly configured Greek territory? What are the means proposed so as to control the meanings ascribed to former Muslim cultural markers within the urban landscape, and how is their treatment envisioned within a process of cultural and political 'rewriting' of the territory? Also, what public affect is produced by such visual prompts, and how does it relate to conceptions of otherness and identity invoked within manifestations of local collective memory?

Through these questions, this paper aims at reflecting on the entanglement between the alterity of the historical marker, and that of religious difference, while underscoring the idea that the state and social stance towards religious otherness, as expressed through the example of the historic Muslim presence in Greece, is a process: politicized, layered and constantly negotiated.

Dr Ömer Fatih Parlak

Lecturer

Department of History, Boğaziçi University

ofatihparlak@gmail.com

Variations in the Iconography of the 'Muslim Other' in the Late Medieval and Early Modern Board Games

What we know about the historical image of the Muslims in Europe is largely based on the research revolving around similar conclusions that pay attention to how wrongly the Muslims had been represented in the visual and textual repository of Europe. This derives mainly from the fact that the analyzed sources were products of - or influenced from - certain propagandas of the time they had been produced. Therefore, historical materials that scholars have used often contain strong biases. A major problem, correspondent to the studies premised on European sources, is that they tend to reflect a predominantly negative Muslim image, which assumption is bereft of wider perspectives, thus, of objectivity. Fortunately, this single-perspectival look at the 'Muslim Other' has recently been challenged by studies demonstrating that the image of the Muslim is not always negative, and can also be pointing at other directions. My study here, in essence, is a counterargument to the perception of the image of the Muslim in mainstream scholarship, which claims that the Western image of Muslim have not changed but remained stable. Quite the contrary, I propose that the Muslim is indeed a multifaceted image that cannot be rendered to a single reading. It has consistently evolved and gained various meanings in different periods, ranging from hostility to companionship, and admiration to representational inexistence. This paper aims to demonstrate the diversion of the 'Muslim Other' image and its changing conceptualization in the late Medieval and early modern board games, a hitherto untouched domain in this regard. In order to do this, late medieval chess literature will be compared to early modern printed board games. It is hoped that the study will contribute to the research with a new perspective about the iconography of the 'Muslim Other' in Europe.